

## Program Efficacy Team Report (Student Services)

**Spring 2020**

**Name of Department:** CalWORKs

**Efficacy Team:** Carol Jones; David Smith; Tim Hosford

**Overall Recommendation:**

Continuation     
  Conditional     
  Probation

**Rationale for Overall Recommendation:**

The program is a valuable one that has done well getting funding. The department provides a pattern of service that meets the needs of its students. It is collaborative with other areas of the campus, and it provides online and one-on-one orientations, employment workshops, and personal skills workshops to its students. The program needs to fully assess its own weaknesses and address problems, such as gaps in data collection and lack of analysis of available data.

The program needs to explain how what they do contributes to student success. Data collection on these could be better, which would allow them to assess how well these services support student success, and being explicit about how the service increases success or is connected to success would help.

The SAO results should be reported in a more meaningful way, such that the impact on student success can be seen. The department provides a list of challenges; however, it does not adequately address plans for how it will meet those challenges.

**Part I: Questions Related to Strategic Initiative: Increase Access**

**Goal: SBVC will improve the application, registration, and enrollment procedures for all students.**

**SBVC Strategic Initiatives:** [Strategic Directions + Goals](#)

	<b>Does Not Meet</b>	<b>Meets</b>	<b>Exceeds</b>
<b>Demographics</b>	The program <b><u>does not provide</u></b> an appropriate analysis regarding identified differences in the program's population compared to that of the general population.	The program <b><u>provides an analysis</u></b> of the demographic data and provides an interpretation in response to any identified variance.  The program <b><u>discusses the plans or activities</u></b> that are in place to recruit and retain underserved populations as appropriate.	In addition to the meets criteria, the program's analysis and plan <b><u>demonstrates a need</u></b> for increased resources.
<b>Pattern of Service</b>	The program's pattern of service is <b><u>not related to the needs of students.</u></b>	The <b><u>program provides</u></b> evidence that the pattern of service or instruction meets student needs.  The program <b><u>discusses the plans or activities</u></b> that are in place to meet a broad range of needs.	In addition to the meets criteria, the program <b><u>demonstrates that the pattern of service needs to be extended.</u></b>

Does Not Meet     Meets     Exceeds

**Efficacy Team Analysis and Feedback:**

The San Bernardino Valley College CalWORKs Program is designed to provide support services to a specific population of students that are low income receiving county cash aid. Students are not required to participate in the SBVC CalWORKs Program but for those that identify a need to utilize the program support services will enroll them.

**Demographics (Meets):** CALWORKS has a significantly higher percentage of females and African Americans than the campus. The CalWORKs program does a good job explaining the high percentage of females. The higher percentage of African-Americans in the CalWORKs Program versus campus wide was believed to be partly due to retention issue for this ethnic group. No further elaboration or data was provided, the Program Review Committee is unclear on how a retention issue results in a higher African-American representation. The CalWORKs' program is underrepresented in terms of Hispanic (12% down), despite community numbers and this was not addressed.

The majority of the students that enroll in the CalWORKs Program are single-parent households consisting of the mother and child/children. San Bernardino County Transitional Assistance Department (TAD) has a high percentage of young single mothers who apply for services with their agency. Females and males that are county CalWORKs eligible and are enrolled at SBVC do not necessarily enroll in the SBVC CalWORKs Program.

**Pattern of Service (Meets):** The CalWORKs department pattern of service serves the needs of the community with various methods. Office hours are Monday through Thursday from 8:00am to 5:00pm and Friday from 8:00am to 4:30pm.

The counseling structure allows for appointments and walk-ins to take place each week.

Students are required to submit certain documentation to remain eligible for services. If a student is unable to deliver the document(s) in-person they have the option of emailing or faxing the document to our office.

Supportive services are disseminated two days every week (Tuesdays and Thursdays from 9:00am to 11:00am and 1:00pm to 3:00pm). The Program Review committee is concerned that eight hours a week for supportive services seems low and we would like to see a list of the services provided in this section.

The department provides supportive services to eligible students on the first Saturday of each Fall and Spring sessions. The department coordinates with the bookstore which is also open that first Saturday to align hours for students to obtain books.

**Efficacy Team Recommendations to Address Does Not Meets (if applicable):** N/A

**Part II: Questions Related to Strategic Initiative: Promote Student Success**

**Goal: SBVC will increase course success, program success, access to employment, and transfer rates by enhancing student learning.**

SBVC Strategic Initiatives: [Strategic Directions + Goals](#)

	Does Not Meet	Meets	Exceeds
<b>Data/Analysis demonstrating achievement of</b>	Program <b><u>does not provide an adequate analysis</u></b> of the data provided with	Program <b><u>provides an analysis</u></b> of the data which indicates progress on departmental goals.	In addition to the meets criteria, the program <b><u>uses the achievement data</u></b> in

instructional or service success	respect to relevant program data.		concrete planning and <b>demonstrates</b> that it is prepared for growth.
Service Area Outcomes and/or Student Learning Outcomes	<p>Program <b>has not demonstrated</b> that it is continuously assessing Service Area Outcomes (SAOs) and/or Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs) based on the plans of the program since their last program efficacy.</p> <p>Evidence of data collection, evaluation, and reflection/feedback, and/or connection to area services is <b>missing or incomplete</b>.</p>	<p>Program <b>has demonstrated</b> that it has fully evaluated within a four-year cycle and is continuously assessing <u>all</u> Service Area Outcomes (SAOs) and/or Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs).</p>	<p>In addition to the meets criteria, the program <b>demonstrates that it has fully incorporated Service Area Outcomes (SAOs) and/or Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs) into its planning, made appropriate adjustments, and is prepared for growth.</b></p>

Does Not Meet       Meets       Exceeds

**Efficacy Team Analysis and Feedback:**

**Data Analysis (Does Not Meet): Descriptions of services would be helpful in order to specifically link these services to student success. Often numbers are presented without analysis and the program sometimes neglects to define what it considers a successful interaction with students and how often that criteria is met.**

“SARS Anywhere” was used to collect data and displays the number of student contacts and reason codes for services provided to students by the office staff. 7/3/17-6/29/18 Drop-in only 375, appointment only 380 and total unduplicated contacts = 519. Why don't these numbers add up if they are unduplicated?

CalWORKs also tumble from 111 placements in 2017 to 76 placements in 2018 – that's a 32% decrease. Please make sure to check your numbers and explain abnormalities in the future.

CalWORKs has between 41-50 students graduating each year from 2014-2017, this numbers are not discussed – it is unclear if this is an acceptable graduation rate or not for the program.

The program provides a list of items that they provide to students (books, gas cards, parking permits, child care, etc.). Yet according to the “Reason Code Summary Report” many of these are listed as zero to only a few student contacted for these items. Given that they serve several hundred students, the numbers of students they contacted for these services seems strange and is cause for concern that data may not be collected or logged properly.

Reason Code summary report (from page 10-11 of efficacy document)

CalWorks – 427      CalWorks Ed Plan – 426      CalWorks Employment Services - 0      CalWork workstudy – 165  
 Career counseling – 0      Computer lab -0      Childcare – 3      Employment and Employment Services – 0  
 Foster Youth program – 0      Transportation – 0

There was no data available for last year's action plan.

Since facilitating employment opportunities is a major goal of the program the Program Review committee strongly recommends that CalWORKs keep track of CalWORKs student employment numbers, encourage a requirement for CalWORK students to attend a certain number of workshops per semester and for its program to better monitor and report workshop attendance data.

**SAO:(Does Not Meet):** The SAO section is a copy/paste of the Program Summary Evaluation Form and the EMP without any extra explanation for the committee.

CalWORKs has one SAO reported, which is: "CalWORKs facilitates employment workshops and one-on-one appointments to prepare and reinforce employability skills to increase their opportunity to obtain employment". They give a pie chart showing 57% of their workshops were non-employment workshops, which without context is not useful. There is no presentation of the actual number of workshops or attendance information. The number of students attending workshops would be valuable information. Students are not required to attend any of the workshops but are encouraged to do so. This SAO has no definition for success and we have no way to understand the percentage that is being reported to measure it as a success or failure.

The SAO is related to work-study placement and from 2015/16 – 2017/18 the number placed were 79, 111, 76. These are more meaningful numbers and should be added to the graphs. When graphs are displayed showing the percentages of work-study students job placement making the 3 years add up to 100% these numbers are not helpful – the committee recommends showing the percentage of students that find work-study versus the total number of students served each year. The raw numbers show 111 students placed in work-study in 2016 and then a drop down to 76 students placed in work-study in 2017 – a 32% drop (then an explanation can be given for this drop).

The list of ways by which the program helps students find work could be expanded to be more specific. Additionally, the committee would like to see a list of the avenues of work-study and employment that the CalWORKS students tend to access.

Under the trends area of the SAO the CalWORKs Program mentions that students who attain full time employment earning more than their cash aid are exited from the program. Is this considered a success by the program? If so, this would be a terrific metric to use.

**Efficacy Team Recommendations to Address Does Not Meets (if applicable):**

**Data Analysis:** Since helping students find employment opportunities is a major goal of the program the committee recommends that CalWORKs keep track of CalWORKs student employment numbers and monitor & report workshop attendance data.

*Make sure to explain the numbers related to services provided that the data shows and how they correlate to student success. Stop showing percentages that split per year – that make the three years add up to 100% - data displayed this way is not helpful or meaningful (page 12 of efficacy).*

**SAO:** The committee strongly recommends that CalWORKs re-write their SAOs so that they are able to be measured in a meaningful way. The program needs a concrete way in which to measure their success. Come up with concrete metrics by which the SAO can be assessed. Examples include, how many students attended workshops, how many students find employment, and how many students that attended workshop were able to find employment.

**Part III: Questions Related to Strategic Initiative: Improve Communication, Culture & Climate**

**Goal: SBVC will promote a collegial campus culture with open line of communication between all stakeholder groups on and off-campus.**

**SBVC Strategic Initiatives:** [Strategic Directions + Goals](#)

	<b>Does Not Meet</b>	<b>Meets</b>	<b>Exceeds</b>
<b>Communication</b>	The program <b>does not identify</b> data that demonstrates communication with college and community.	The program <b>identifies</b> data that demonstrates communication with college and community.	In addition to the meets criteria, the program <b>describes</b> plans for extending communication with college and community and provides data or research that <b>demonstrates</b> the need for additional resources.
<b>Culture &amp; Climate</b>	The program <b>does not identify</b> its impact on culture and climate or the plans are not supported by the data and information provided.	The program <b>identifies and describes</b> its impact on culture and climate. Program <b>addresses</b> how this impacts planning.	In addition to the meets criteria, the program provides data or research that <b>demonstrates</b> the need for additional resources.

Does Not Meet       Meets       Exceeds

**Efficacy Team Analysis and Feedback:**

**Communication: (Meets)** CalWORKs collaborates with a number of other services on campus—CWD (County Welfare Department), EOPS/CARE, DSPS, Financial Aid, etc. CalWORKs representatives provide outreach on-campus and within the community. The program also collaborates with Marketing to post events and information on the SBVC Website, SBVC Facebook Page, and SBVC Twitter Account. Electronic delivery of program services is disseminated directly to San Bernardino County Transitional Assistance Department (TAD) Welfare-to-Work workers and community partners.

**Culture and Climate: (Meets)** The program provides an extensive list of events and services on and off-campus collaborations; however, there is no data to address the impact of those events/services or discussion of future planning. Some of the programs offered are truly impressive and the ads and flyers promoting these programs and events are excellent, however, the program review committee is concerned that the efficacy report was submitted in the Spring of 2020 and no new events have been mentioned since May of 2018.

Given recent developments, the team would have liked to know whether the CalWORKs program interacts with the Food Pantry and the expansion of mental health services at the Student Health Center. This section would also be strengthened with a more specific description of the methods by which other programs refer students to CalWORKS and vice versa. We would also like to see a bit more elaboration in the plans area.

**Efficacy Team Recommendations to Address Does Not Meets (if applicable):** N/A

**IV: Questions Related to Strategic Initiative: Maintain Leadership & Promote Professional Development**

**Goal:** SBVC will maintain capable leadership and provide professional development to a staff that will need skills to function effectively in an evolving educational environment.

SBVC Strategic Initiatives: [Strategic Directions + Goals](#)

	<b>Does Not Meet</b>	<b>Meets</b>	<b>Exceeds</b>
<b>Professional Development</b>	The program <b>does not identify</b> currency in professional development activities.	Program <b>identifies current avenues</b> for professional development.	In addition to the meets criteria, the program shows that professional development has <b>impacted/expanded</b> the

			program and <b>demonstrates</b> that the program is positioning itself for growth.
--	--	--	--

Does Not Meet     Meets     Exceeds

**Efficacy Team Analysis and Feedback:**

Team members attend a number of workshops, conferences and technical training on and off campus including the annual CalWORKs training Institute and various professional development put on by our campus. It may be useful for CalWORKs to describe the training and Professional Development in a bit more detail, and explain how it benefits them and their students.

**Efficacy Team Recommendations to Address Does Not Meets (if applicable):** N/A

**V: Questions Related to Strategic Initiative: Effective Evaluation & Accountability**

**Goal: SBVC will improve institutional effectiveness through a process of evaluation and continuous improvement.**

SBVC Strategic Initiatives: [Strategic Directions + Goals](#)

	<b>Does Not Meet</b>	<b>Meets</b>	<b>Exceeds</b>
<b>Mission/ Statement of Purpose</b>	The program <b><u>does not have</u></b> a mission/ statement of purpose, or it <b><u>does not clearly link</u></b> with the institutional mission.	The program <b><u>has</u></b> a mission/statement of purpose, and it <b><u>links</u></b> clearly with the institutional mission.	
<b>Productivity</b>	The data <b><u>does not show</u></b> an acceptable level of productivity for the program, or the issue of productivity is not adequately addressed.	The data <b><u>shows</u></b> the program is productive at an acceptable level.	The program demonstrates that it is highly productive and is positioning itself for growth.
<b>Relevance, Currency, Articulation</b>	The program <b><u>does not provide</u></b> evidence that it is relevant, current, and that courses articulate with CSU/UC, if appropriate.  <u>Out of date course(s) that were not launched into Curricunet by Oct. 1, 2017 may result in an overall recommendation no higher than Conditional.</u>	The program <b><u>provides</u></b> evidence that the curriculum review process is up to date. Courses are relevant and current to the mission of the program.  Appropriate courses <b><u>have been articulated</u></b> or transfer with UC/CSU, or <b><u>plans are in place</u></b> to articulate appropriate courses.	In addition to the meets criteria, the program <b><u>discusses plans</u></b> to enhance current offerings that link to student/community needs and positions the program for growth.

<b>Challenges</b>	The program <b><u>does not incorporate</u></b> weaknesses and challenges into planning.	The program <b><u>incorporates</u></b> weaknesses and challenges into planning.	The program <b><u>incorporates</u></b> weaknesses and challenges into planning that demonstrate the need for expansion.
-------------------	---	---	---

**Does Not Meet**       **Meets**       **Exceeds**

**Efficacy Team Analysis and Feedback:**

**Mission (Meets):** CalWORKs’ mission statement is in line with that of the college. The objective of the program is to “provide educational opportunities that will result in career preparation for individuals who are currently receiving welfare, transitioning off welfare, unemployed or under- employed to achieve economic stability”.

**Productivity (Does Not Meet):** Satisfaction and productivity are defined by being able to monitor the results of progress. Achievement status for CalWORKs students is tracked by monitoring the degree/certificate/transfer status by utilizing the California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office DataMart software. This is done on a three-year cycle and is an ongoing effort. The numbers of students in the program was mentioned to be 519 in 2018 and that same year 50 CalWORKs students receive Associates or Certificates. The graduation/transfer rate is about 10% of the students being served in a year; how does this compare to the campus-wide graduation & transfer rates? More context is needed to sufficiently evaluate the success of the program. Is a 10% graduation/transfer rate considered reasonable or should the program plan to increase this number? The team has concerns about the attendance forms and whether they adequately facilitate data collection and instructor involvement.

**Relevance/Currency: (Meets)** The program addresses both online and one-on-one orientations, employment workshops, and personal skills workshops that are provided to students.

**Challenges (Does Not Meet):** CalWORKs mentions having an issue with choosing appropriate data collecting and measuring services to measure attendance and feedback. They mention they will address deficiency but do not go into any detail on how they plan to do this. Currently a lot of the statistics reported are not meaningful. CalWORKs needs to work with the research office to help come up with ideas on how to measure i.e. workshop attendance, employment, employment readiness, etc. that match their goals and mission more directly. Some of the problem is likely related to the way SAO data is being graphically presented. Make sure to show productivity and success per year. When making a pie graph make sure the data is meaningful.

**Efficacy Team Recommendations to Address Does Not Meets (if applicable):**

The program should more specifically address CalWORKs weaknesses so tools can be developed to improve these areas. The committee recommends that the California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office Special Population/Group Program Awards Summary Report be better explanation in context. Some in-depth analysis of the program fund allocation would be useful, as well.

**Productivity:** Contextualize the graduation/transfer data by showing a comparison to the college-wide data and discuss whether this is meeting the desired or targeted value and whether or not we need improvement. Assess whether current methods of attendance verification are sufficient.

**Challenges:** Work with the research office to help come up with ideas on what to measure that will be meaningful to your program (i.e. workshop attendance, employment, employment readiness, etc.) that match departmental goals and mission more directly.

**VI: Questions Related to Strategic Initiative: Provide Exceptional Facilities**

**Goal: SBVC will support the construction and maintenance of safe, efficient, and functional facilities and infrastructure to meet the needs of students, employees, and the community.**

SBVC Strategic Initiatives: [Strategic Directions + Goals](#)

	<b>Does Not Meet</b>	<b>Meets</b>	<b>Exceeds</b>
<b>Facilities</b>	The program <b><u>does not provide an evaluation</u></b> that addresses the sustainability of the physical environment for its programs.	Program <b><u>provides an evaluation</u></b> of the physical environment for its programs and <b><u>presents evidence</u></b> to support the evaluation.	In addition to the meets criteria, the program has <b><u>developed a plan</u></b> for obtaining or utilizing additional facilities for program growth.

Does Not Meet     Meets     Exceeds

**Efficacy Team Analysis and Feedback:**

The CalWORKs Programs workspace is adequate for employees. However, they report that during high peak times the entrance area, small computer lab area, and the open space becomes overcrowded with students and/or community members. The program includes photos that greatly assist in illustrating the spatial resources the program has access to. For future reports, some numbers on traffic, peak times, and computer usage could further bolster the program's facilities needs.

**Efficacy Team Recommendations to Address Does Not Meets (if applicable):** N/A

**VII: Previous Does Not Meet Categories**

Does Not Meet     Meets     Exceeds

**Efficacy Team Analysis and Feedback:**

Instead of submitting a response to the Spring 2019 efficacy they resubmitted the entire report anew.

**Efficacy Team Recommendations to Address Does Not Meets (if applicable):** N/A